



CITY OF SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS
OFFICE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
JOSEPH A. CURTATONE
MAYOR

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MINUTES

Tuesday, September 21, 2010
City Hall
3rd Floor Conference Room
6:40 p.m.

Staff Present: Kristi Chase and Brandon Wilson.

Members Present: Dick Bauer, Tom DeYoung, Abby Freedman, and Eric Parkes.

Members Absent: Kevin Allen*, DJ Chagnon*, Sarah Degutis*, Ryan Falvey, O. Susan Fontano*, Barbara Mangum, Michael Payne, Derick Snare*, and Brad Stearns.*

*Alternates

Others present: David Abrahams, Rocco Antonelli, Alan Bingham, Rosemary Broome-Bingham, Nick and Natale Bonugli, Gorka Brabo, Natasha Burger, Ronald Dynneson, Garrett Laws, James McGinnis, Livy Parsons, Amie Schaeffer, Alberto Solutore, Kelly Speakman, James & Dina Traniello, Marta Wozniak.

The meeting was called to order at 6:50 PM.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Commission voted 4-0 to accept the August 17, 2010 minutes as amended.

DELIBERATION OF HPC CASES

HPC 10.65 – 15 Westwood Road: Applicant: Ryan Demirgian, Contractor for Margie Alonso Jackson and Ramon Alonso, Owners, seeks a **Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A)** for the following:



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
(617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



1. Strip 3-tab asphalt shingle roof;
2. Replace with CertainTeed® Silver Birch color Landmark architectural shingles; and
3. Install ridge vents.

***Staff presented** in the absence of the Contractor or Homeowner.*

***Staff recommendations** were read.*

No **Public Comment** was received.

***Discussion:** While the light color was chosen because it was the only EnergyStar® approved color in the Landmark series of shingles, it could be seen as silvered and bleached wood. It was noted that the color chosen could be more effective with different trim and body colors but was otherwise appropriate.*

***Documents:** City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, HPC Guidelines, Staff recommendations, photos of the building and sample materials.*

***Decisions:** The Commission voted unanimously (4-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A) for the replacement of 3-tab asphalt shingles with CertainTeed® Silver Birch color Landmark architectural shingles because the replacement with the chosen architectural shingles was closer to the original wood shingle style than the 3-tab shingles and therefore met HPC Guidelines.*

HPC: 10.64 – 45 Walnut Street: Applicants: Luann & David Abrahams, Owners, seek a Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A) and a Certificate of Non-Applicability (C/NA) for the following:

1. Repair storm damage to slate roof, gutters, and fascia (C/NA); and
2. Install snow hooks or snow guards (C/A).

***David Abrahams presented.** The last winter had been particularly harsh. The weight of the snow had damaged a part of the slate roof, the gutters and the fascia. Their roofer recommended using snow hooks or guards.*

***Staff recommendations** were read.*

No **Public Comment** was received.

***Discussion:** The Commission wanted to know whether the hooks would be installed around the entire roof or only in the valley that had the snow build-up and how they were installed.*

***Documents:** City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, Property Form B, HPC Guidelines, Staff recommendations, photos of the building and sample pigtail snow guard.*

***Decisions:** The Commission voted unanimously (4-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A) to install pigtail snow hooks or snow guards because the alteration would be historically appropriate and therefore met HPC Guidelines.*

HPC 10.69 – 63 Columbus Avenue: Applicants: Mandeliene and Livingston Parsons, Owners, seek a Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A) for the following:

1. Install box type chimney caps on 2 chimneys (C/A).

Livy Parsons presented. *This years heavy rains revealed several leaks around the chimneys. The chimneys had been repointed on the exterior only 7 years ago. A chimney specialist recommended lining the chimney and the installation of chimney caps. The box type cap is fairly common and similar to the box cap they have on the new chimney. The proposed cap would be closer to the top of the chimney with a lower profile than the existing one which they found to be more prominent than they had expected when it was planned.*

Staff recommendations were read.

No **Public Comment** was received.

Discussion: *The Commission was particularly concerned about the profile of the chimney and whether the cap would be too prominent. The cut sheet was for a stainless steel cap which was considered too shiny. It was agreed that the finish of the cap should be matte black or copper to be appropriate.*

Documents: *City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, Property Form B, HPC Guidelines, Staff recommendations, photos of the building and cut sheet from the manufacturer.*

Decisions: *The Commission voted unanimously (4-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A) to install matte black or copper box type chimney caps on 2 chimneys because the alteration would be inconspicuous and therefore met HPC Guidelines.*

HPC 10.75 – 83 Boston Street: Applicant: James Traniello and Loretta McCormack Realty Trust, Owner seeks a **Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A)** and a **Certificate of Non-Applicability (C/NA)** for the following:

1. Remove existing wood shingle siding (C/A);
2. Replace with clapboards, shingles, batten boards as appropriate per circa 1946 photo (C/NA);
3. Repair or replace wood windows and other damage trim in-kind as necessary (C/NA).

James Traniello presented. *His family has owned the building since 1946. It was his father who was responsible for the installation of the wood shingles that obscures the Queen Anne characteristics of the building and submitted a circa 1946 photo. He intends to restore the building beginning next spring, starting with the structural work for the porte-cochere. He believes that some of the columns are rotted and will need to be replaced. He intends to have them milled to replicate the historic column.*

Staff recommendations were read.

No **Public Comment** was received.

Discussion: *The Commission applauded the plans to bring the building back. There was some discussion about window repair and types of storm windows.*

Documents: *City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, Property Form B, HPC Guidelines, Staff recommendations, both current and historic photos of the building.*

Decisions: *The Commission voted unanimously (4-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove existing wood shingle siding; and to issue a Certificate of Non-Applicability to replace rotted or damaged clapboards, shingles, batten boards as appropriate per circa 1946 photo; and repair or replace wood windows and other damage trim in-kind as necessary because they met HPC Guidelines.*

HPC 10.77 – 36 Bow Street: Applicant: Marta Wozniak, Office Manager for Dr. Sandhya Goli, DDS, Tenant, seeks a **Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A)** for the following:

1. Install four (4) temporary 18 square foot banners on front of the mixed-use historic building for a maximum of 30 days (C/A).

Marta Wozniak presented. *Due to a fall off in the number of patients when Mass Health changed their benefits, they need to attract more customers. They thought that the banners would bring more people into their office so they ordered them and installed them on the building. There are 3 banners of 24 SF and one banner of 18 SF. She apologized; they didn't know that they needed permits for temporary signs and would be willing to install only one banner.*

Staff recommendations were read.

Public Comment: *Jim McGinnis, Owner of a house in the Bow Street District and resident was shocked to see the signs. The building is part of Doctors' Row which consists of residential structures with professional offices. The banners are larger than any other signs in the District and are very out of character. He does not want to see the banners re-installed. A sign such as the permanent signs at 30 Bow Street and 34 Bow Street would be acceptable to him.*

Discussion: *Dick Bauer read relevant parts of the City's Ordinance. The Commission noted that although they were sympathetic to their need to get more patients, it would be bad precedent to allow the reinstallation of the large banners. Abby Freedman noted that the yoga studio had very discreet but nice symbols on their blinds. Marta Wozniak responded that the dental office had very limited windows and that the daylight was very much appreciated by the patients. Shades would make the rooms too dark. Also, Patients have trouble finding the office because it is located in a house.*

Abby Freedman suggested that possibly a sign on the railing would attract more attention. The Commission would have to review the graphics, the colors and the typeface which would need to compliment the building and the District. Good graphic design and a different style should make a difference. If a sign were to be hung from the railings, it would have to appear temporary but could become permanent. Perhaps a design competition would appeal to the local artists and garner some interest in their business.

There was further discussion about signage and what was appropriate. Signs need to be considered for their impact in the long-term, assuming that the business would be there for some time. Their effect on perception of the entire street and district not just the one business. They need to conform to the requirements of the City's Ordinance and be compatible with the district. They should be no more than 12 SF in area. They could be made of fabric. Even if temporary, up to 30 days, they should be reviewed by Staff; otherwise the Applicant needs to come back to the Commission for a more permanent sign.

Staff recommended that the Applicant meet with David Guzman, who runs the Small Business Program and the Storefront Improvement Program for the City for help.

Documents: *City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, Property Form B, HPC Guidelines, Staff recommendations, and photos of the building and banners.*

Decisions: *The Commission voted unanimously with no members for, and four against (0-4) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to re-install the banners that were up from August 17, 2010 until at least August 20, 2010 because they did not meet the Guidelines. They also voted unanimously (4-0) to issue a Certificate of Non-Applicability for a banner that meets the requirements noted above.*

HPC 10.73 – 30 Day Street: Applicants: Rosemary Broome Bingham and Alan Bingham, Owners, seek a **Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A)** and a **Certificate of Non-Applicability (C/NA)** for the following:

1. Remove bulkhead and entry on south side (C/A);
2. Replace bulkhead with new stairs and guardrails (C/A);
3. Relocate adjacent entry to rear of house (C/NA);
4. Enlarge basement window on north side with double-hung 2/2 sash and a window well (C/A).

Alan Bingham presented. *They bought the house in April. They are the 3rd family to own the building since it was constructed. The previous owner had done nothing on the house since his father died. They are reconfiguring the house and are removing the 2nd floor apartment. Instead, there will be a basement apartment. The bulkhead and nearby back entry stairs would be removed. The entry to the new basement apartment would be located where the bulkhead is now, but the stairs and landing would occupy some of the space where the back entry is now located. That back entry would be relocated around the back of the building where it is not visible from the public right of way. They also need to construct a second means of egress. To do this, they would like to enlarge a basement window on the north side of the house. It would be double-hung and match the other windows. It would be hidden in a berm and behind the HVAC equipment. It would not be visible from the public right of way.*

Staff recommendations were read.

No **Public Comment** was received.

Discussion: *Eric Parkes had a small question about the window well and how the retaining wall would be constructed? Overall, the Commission liked their approach to restoration. They thought the plans were well thought out and well-presented.*

Documents: *City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, Property Form B, HPC Guidelines, Staff recommendations, photos of the building, plans dated September 2, 2010 by Design Associates Inc.*

Decisions: *The Commission voted unanimously (4-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to*

1. Remove bulkhead and entry on south side; and
 2. Replace bulkhead with new stairs and guardrails;
- and issue a Certificate of Non-Applicability to*
3. Relocate adjacent entry to rear of house; and

4. Enlarge basement window on north side with double-hung 2/2 sash ; and
5. Create a window well.

Because they met HPC Guidelines for visibility.

HPC 10.72 – 18 Summit Avenue: Applicants: Ann Marie and Natale Bonugli, Owners, seek a **Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A)** or a **Certificate of Hardship (C/H)** for the following:

1. Remove existing slate roof (C/H); and
2. Replace with architectural shingles as seen on 48 Walnut Street (C/A).

***Nick Bonugli presented** with a few comments from Natale Bonugli and Alberto Solutore, roofer. His family has done everything possible to keep the house in good condition, but they cannot do so any longer. They used a lot of silicone to stop leaks and seal cracks. The roof is no good and they have done everything feasible to prolong its life. They do not want Natale Bonugli to climb the ladder to the roof any more. They cannot afford to replace the roof because Natale has not worked in a year and his mother, Ann Marie for much longer than that. While they have some rental income from the tenants of the house, it pays the basic bills and does not cover the amount needed for such a large project. They also have many other bills.*

The other houses on the street have also had their slate roofs replaced with decorative asphalt shingles. The Bonuglis like the way it has been done. They intend to retain the design of the roof only do it in CertainTeed® Carriage House™ asphalt shingles. Their preferred color is the Gatehouse slate. Alberto Solutore noted that there were essentially 3 options: slate, synthetic slate or asphalt. Asphalt was the most affordable. His shingles were guaranteed for life.

***Staff recommendations** were read.*

***Public Comment** was received. **Garrett Laws**, slate roofer, noted that he had been on the roof. It was sheathed in Pennsylvania slate. It starts out as a black slate but over time, it fades and falls apart. The slate is so porous that it had discolored to appear to be Vermont fading green slate due to algae. If you tap it, it sounds like wet cardboard. **Kelly Speakman** said that it would be better to go for a solid color asphalt shingle that would be more in tune with the original roof. **Garrett Laws** spent some time searching the internet for a roof shingle system that incorporated both square and scalloped asphalt roof systems that would meet the Applicants' needs.*

***Discussion:** The Commission discussed the relative costs of the various materials. The Commission discussed the need to keep the proportion of square and scalloped shingles to retain the look of the roof. The proposed shingle had a definite wide shadow line. Abby Freedman said that it was a handsome house and that roof should err on the direction of subtlety. Hardship is based on the condition of the roof materials and the finances of the Applicants. It was proposed that some time would be needed to research the alternatives. Decision letter not to be sent out for one week from meeting to find alternatives.*

***Documents:** City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, Property Form B, HPC Guidelines, Staff recommendations, PowerPoint slides of existing conditions, photos of proposed materials, the landscape plan dated July 20, 2009 by Joanne Paul and e-mail.*

***Decisions:** The Commission voted unanimously (4-0) to grant a **Certificate of Hardship** to*

1. Remove the highly deteriorated Pennsylvania slate roof shingles; and

2. Replace with CertainTeed® Grand Manor™ and Carriage House™ Black Pearl colored architectural shingles installed with the same proportions of square and scalloped shingles as the existing roof,

because it was financially infeasible for the Owners to make the needed complete reroofing in-kind. Strictures were placed upon the Certificate, noting that the replacement of the slate with architectural shingles was for this reroofing only. A subsequent owner will need to reroof with slate shingles.

HPC 10.74 - 221 Morrison Avenue: Applicants: Ronald and Linde Dynneson, Owners, seek a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for the following:

1. Remove existing aluminum siding (C/A);
2. Restore, repair or replace damaged wood clapboard, and trim in-kind (C/NA);
3. Install ½ round metal gutters and downspouts (C/A);
4. Construct a new addition as per plans and elevations dated 9/1/2010 (C/A).

Ron Dynneson presented. *Ron and his wife own a three bedroom Bed and Breakfast. As they are going to undergo renovations shortly to expand to 5 bedrooms, Ron believes that security bars on the downstairs bedroom windows will be necessary for the safety of his guests. After the Commission's discussion about the security bars, Ron requested that the security bars be withdrawn from his application so that he may do further research and investigation first.*

Staff recommendations were read.

Public Comment was received. **Rocco Antonelli** suggested Ron secure the bottom sash so that only the upper sash can be opened

Discussion: *The Commission commended the scale and lack of visibility of the rear addition, from the street. The Commission discussed several alternatives to the security bars, including interior security, talking with the fire department for suggestions, and walking around Beacon Hill.*

Documents: *City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, Property Form B, HPC Guidelines, Staff recommendations, PowerPoint slides of existing conditions, photos of proposed materials, the landscape plan dated July 20, 2009 by Joanne Paul and e-mail.*

Decisions: *The Commission voted unanimously (4-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to*

1. Remove existing aluminum siding (C/A);
 2. Install ½ round metal gutters and downspouts (C/A); and
 3. Construct a new addition as per plans and elevations dated 9/1/2010 (C/A);
- and issue a **Certificate of Non-Applicability**, with staff review if necessary to*
4. Restore, repair or replace damaged wood clapboard, and trim in-kind (C/NA).

HPC 10.76 – 23 Porter Street: Applicants: Rocco Antonelli, Architect and Lalo Development Corporation, LLC, Owner, seek a **Review and Comment** for the following:

1. Restore, repair or replace damaged wood clapboard, soffits, fascia, and trim in-kind (C/NA); and
2. Construct a new addition per plans and elevations dated 9/3/2010 (C/A).

DEMOLITION REVIEW

HPC 09.67 – 378-382 Somerville Avenue, formerly Londontowne Antiques: Applicant: W. James Herbert, Trustee.

Subcommittee meetings have been held with the HPC Staff, other OSPCD Staff, the Owner, his architects, and a representative from the Design Review Committee. The Applicant's team has prepared plans to develop the entire site and retain the historic façade of the building. A draft Memoranda of Agreement is being prepared for review and approval by the SHPC.

Applicant has requested a continuance until 10/19/2010 in order to read the MOA and to propose changes.

HPC 10.81 – 16 Webster Street – circa 1895 Barn 09/17/10
Applicant: Anthony Nargi

Determined to be unsafe by Inspectional Services per MGL Chapter 143, section 9

SECTION 106 REVIEWS CONDUCTED BY THE STAFF

HPC 10.79 – Green Line Extension (GLX) 09/08/10

Two meetings scheduled in October with MassDOT and consulting parties from Massachusetts Historical Commission, and Medford, Somerville, Cambridge and Boston historical commissions.

CERTIFICATES OF NON-APPLICABILITY ISSUED BY THE STAFF

HPC 10.67 – 48 Vinal Avenue 08/19/10
Applicant: Antonio Martins, Owner

1. Re-roof left side of house with 30 year 3-tab asphalt shingles.

HPC 10.68 – 141 Central Street 08/30/10
Applicant: Susan Rabinowitz, Owner

1. Remove/strip approx. 500 SF. of rubber roofing;
2. Install new ½" Polyiso insulation to roof; and
3. Install new fully adhered rubber membrane to roof.

HPC 10.78 – 12 Westwood Road 09/07/10
Applicants: Cheryl Lagassey & Linda Lacroix, Owners

1. Replace Andersen® double casement window in-kind.

DEMOLITIONS REVIEWED AND APPROVED BY THE STAFF

HPC 10.61 – 18 Alpine Street, 1922 Concrete Block Garage 08/02/10
Applicant: Patricia Dougan, Owner

STAFF REVIEW AND COMMENTS AS PER REQUEST OF THE PLANNING DIVISION

HPC10.71 – 25 Hamlet Street 08/30/10

The Historic Preservation Commission determined that while the existing barn was of historical interest, its condition was so poor that it would not be in the public interest to attempt preservation. New dwelling units constructed on the site would hide the barn from the public view and would make any attempt to save it moot with no public benefit gained.

In respect to the proposed new building, Staff believes that it is consistent with HPC Guidelines for infill construction and will fit in well with the fabric of the neighborhood because it has similar massing and form to existing structures on Hamlet Street. Its height is comparable and will not overwhelm the site. The narrow front unit is comparable to the verticality of Queen Anne and Italianate style buildings, although it is missing the interest of a bay window at the front. The addition of a bay window on the rear unit gives distinction there, but it is not visible from the street.

PROJECT UPDATES AND OTHER BUSINESS

Project Updates

- **Historic Designation Reports**
 - **LHD Expansion Project** (Brandon Wilson with Kristi Chase & Amie Schaeffer)
 - Group C submission to BOA in April awaiting scheduling of joint public hearing post summer recess
 - Group D package compilation in progress for future submission to BOA
 - **Morrison Avenue Historic District** (Brandon Wilson)
 - Recording at South Middlesex Registry of Deeds completed; awaiting final copy
- **Milk Row Cemetery Restoration Project - Phase II** (Brandon Wilson)
 - Installation of appropriate bench, trash barrels, and bike rack just outside the Cemetery requested of DPW now that Somerville Avenue reconstruction almost completed
 - Installation of bike racks within Market Basket site requested of DeMoulas to avoid long-term damage to newly restored iron fencing
 - Planting of appropriate perennials in grounds being coordinated with Somerville Garden Club
 - Installation of water spigot by DPW inside Cemetery for long-term maintenance of plantings
 - Planning of Ghosts of Somerville event weekend of October 16-17 in progress with Historic Somerville Inc., and perhaps in coordination with “SomersStreets” event on Somerville Avenue
- **Union Square Historic Surveying Project** (Brandon Wilson with Kristi Chase)
 - Submission by consultant PAL of final drafts of survey Form Bs and Form As in progress
 - Review meeting with PAL re: recommended LHD and NR boundaries 9-16-10
 - Additional survey work on Walnut St. property in progress
 - Walking Tour of Union Square highlighting many of surveyed properties to be led by Edward Gordon on Sunday, Nov. 7th, 2-5 pm
- **Preservation Newsletter Project** (Amie Schaeffer with Brandon Wilson & Kristi Chase)
 - Newsletter #1 draft awaiting Monica’s review and approval
 - Newsletter #2 preliminary draft awaiting completion of #1
- **Prospect Hill Tower Assessment Study** (Brandon Wilson)
 - Review meeting with TBA Architects, Inc. 9-16-10
 - Preliminary recommendations expected by mid-October
- **Other Historic Events**
 - Exhibit in “Celebration of Fred Lund’s 90th Birthday” showcasing his artwork over many decades currently on display at Somerville Armory through the month of October

- Historic Bike Tour of Middlesex Canal led in part by Dick Bauer, SHPC Chairman, on Sat. Oct. 2nd, meeting at 9am at Sullivan Station
- **Certified Local Government Annual Reports** (Kristi Chase with Brandon Wilson)
 - Draft of Year 2009 Report awaiting final insertions by Rob before submission to MHC
- **Preservation Awards Program** (Brandon Wilson with Amie Schaeffer)
 - 2009 Awards now on exhibit at City Hall, 2nd floor before returned to owners by end of year
 - 2010 Awards on exhibit at Century Bank on Fellsway West through the fall

Upcoming Meeting Schedule for 2010: October 19, November 16, and December 21.